GI pricing practices market study: over-reaction or a long time coming?



4 October 2019

Today, the FCA published the interim report of its general insurance market study.¹ A year in the making, it diagnoses complex problems and lists possible remedies.

But how easy will it be for the FCA to address its concerns? And what can insurers do now, in response to these concerns?

While the scope of the market study is home and motor insurance, we expect the lessons learned and proposed remedies to set the scene for FCA supervision of other insurance markets in the years to come.

What are the FCA's concerns?

The FCA found that the home and motor insurance markets are 'not working well for consumers', with particular concerns around firms' complex pricing practices that allow them to raise prices for consumers that renew.²

It estimates that 6m consumers paid 'high margins'³ in 2018. Further, the FCA states that insurers discourage shopping around, resulting in consumers not switching, negotiating or researching their options.

In addition:

- there is evidence of price walking, as new customers typically pay lower premiums, and tenure is associated with steadily increasing margins;
- home insurance policies which are set up to auto-renew tend to have higher prices (than those which are not set up auto-renew);
- one third of consumers who paid high prices showed at least one characteristic of vulnerability;
- underwriters and intermediaries earn profits primarily from products such as add-ons and premium finance.

Importantly, however, while insurers are profitable, there is no evidence that these profits are excessive.

¹ FCA (2019), <u>'General insurance pricing practices: interim report'</u>, October.

² Ibid. para. 1.5. ³ Tho 'bigh margin' throu

³ The 'high margin' threshold is set at a premium 50% above the competitive premium, given the market average margin.

What will the FCA do?

In addition to its focus on ensuring good governance, the FCA is actively considering 'supplyside' remedies. Some of the strongest ones (in terms of changing the current market) include:

- price regulation, through restricting or banning pricing practices such as margin optimisation based on renewal likelihood;
- automatic switching of consumers paying high prices to lower-priced products with equivalent cover;
- restricting or banning auto-renewal, or making auto-renewal opt-in only;
- requiring firms to be transparent about their pricing strategies and the reasons for price increases;
- requiring firms to publish information about their price differentials between customers.

The FCA does not elaborate on how these remedies will help some consumers at the expense of others; or explore whether the remedies could damage competition in the market.

How can insurers respond?

- Proactively monitor and improve pricing practices by examining the whole distribution of consumer outcomes, rather than focusing on averages.
- Investigate consumer segments where there are significantly higher margins.
- Ensure clear communication and protection of vulnerable customers.

The Oxera framework⁴ has been used successfully as a tool by senior decision-makers in financial services to develop such business models. This tool has helped insurers move towards more sustainable business models.⁵

We encourage all insurers to engage with the debate actively, as any remedy will need careful design.

⁴ Oxera (2019), '<u>Fair ground: a practical framework for assessing fairness</u>', Agenda, March.
⁵ Find out more about Oxera's Agenda campaign, '<u>Beyond the Bottom Line'</u>.

Oxera Consulting LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in England no. OC392464, registered office: Park Central, 40/41 Park End Street, Oxford OX1 1JD, UK; in Belgium, no. 0651 990 151, branch office: Avenue Louise 81, 1050 Brussels, Belgium; and in Italy, REA no. RM - 1530473, branch office: Via delle Quattro Fontane 15, 00184 Rome, Italy. Oxera Consulting (France) LLP, a French branch, registered office: 60 Avenue Charles de Gaulle, CS 60016, 92573 Neuilly-sur-Seine, France and registered in Nanterre, RCS no. 844 900 407 00025. Oxera Consulting (Netherlands) LLP, a Dutch branch, registered office: Strawinskylaan 3051, 1077 ZX Amsterdam, The Netherlands and registered in Amsterdam, KvK no. 72446218. Oxera Consulting GmbH is registered in Germany, no. HRB 148781 B (Local Court of Charlottenburg), registered office: Rahel-Hirsch-Straße 10, Berlin 10557, Germany. Although every effort has been made to ensure the accuracy of the material and the integrity of the analysis presented herein, Oxera accepts no liability for any actions taken on the basis of its contents. No Oxera entity is either authorised or regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority or the Prudential Regulation Authority within the UK or any other financial authority applicable in other countries. Anyone considering a specific investment should consult their own broker or other investment adviser. Oxera accepts no liability for any specific investment decision, which must be at the investor's own risk. © Oxera 2019. All rights reserved. Except for the quotation of short passages for the purposes of criticism or review, no part may be used or reproduced without permission.